

HARROGATE BOROUGH COUNCIL

PLANNING AREA2 DC COMMITTEE – AGENDA ITEM 5: LIST OF PLANS.

DATE: 6 April 2004

PLAN: 12	CASE NUMBER: 03/04535/FUL
APPLICATION NO. 6.100.108.O.FUL	GRID REF: EAST 434750 NORTH 457100
	DATE MADE VALID: 22.09.2003
	TARGET DATE: 17.11.2003
	WARD: Knaresborough King

James

APPLICANT: Mr Leo Campagna

AGENT: Woodhall Planning & Conservation

PROPOSAL: Demolition of restaurant and cottage, and erection of 3 no houses and 2 no apartments with various tree works including felling within the Knaresborough Conservation Area (revised scheme, site area 0.114ha).

LOCATION: Da Mario Restaurant 15 Waterside Knaresborough North Yorkshire HG5 9AZ

REPORT

SITE AND PROPOSAL

This is a joint report covering an application for conservation area consent for the demolition of the cottage and restaurant at 15 Waterside Knaresborough and the redevelopment of the site and the car park with five dwellings providing 3no two bed units, 1no three bed unit and 1no. four bed unit.

The application site lies in a prominent location in the Conservation Area below the viaduct (a listed structure) on Waterside. It comprises a two storey property set at right angles to waterside and an attached restaurant. The restaurant car park lies to the south east of the viaduct.

The site would be cleared and replaced with two dwellings to the left of the viaduct and three dwellings to the right of the viaduct on the car park.

Unit 1 is a three bedroomed property, two storey constructed in stone, brick and render with a natural slate roof.

Unit 2 is a four bedroomed, three storey property constructed in stone and render with a slate roof.

Units 3 is a three storey town house providing two bedroomed accommodation constructed in render with a slate roof.

Units 4 and 5 are apartments with ground floor parking and two apartments above each providing two bedroomed accommodation. The apartments are constructed in stone, brick and render with slate roofs.

Units 3,4 and 5 on the site of the car park are attached to each other although the massing is broken up by design.

The applications are accompanied by an assessment of the scheme against the Planning Inspectors conclusions

MAIN ISSUES

The main issues in this case are the impact of the proposals on the character and appearance of the conservation area and linked to that the setting of the nearby listed buildings.

RELEVANT SITE HISTORY

The site has a long planning history, however, the most pertinent history relates to the appeal decisions last year.

6.100.108.M.FUL Application for 2 houses and 6 apartments Appeal dismissed

6.100.108.N.CON Conservation area consent for the demolition of the house and restaurant. Appeal dismissed.

CONSULTATIONS/NOTIFICATIONS

Parish Council
Knaresborough

D.L.A.S Arboricultural Officer
Advises no trees worthy of note would be affected

Knaresborough Civic Society
No comments received
Conservation and Design Section
See Assessment

DLAS - Open Space
Advise of an open space commuted sum of £5172.00 allocated to Highbridge Park, Knaresborough House and Conyngham Hall. A unilateral agreement has been signed.

H.B.C Land Drainage
No comments

Environment Agency
No objections

Economic Development Officer

The proposal will lead to the loss of part of the tourist "package". Residential redevelopment will not add to the local economy and there is no support from an economic development perspective

English Heritage

Welcomes the reduction in building volume and consider the development would not detract from the setting of neighbouring buildings in the conservation area or the viaduct

Environmental Health

Advises a Phase I desk top assessment as there may be contamination of the site. There is also a need to provide adequate provision for the storage of refuse

Chief Engineer (H and T)

Recommends conditions

Network Rail

No objection

Yorkshire Water

Recommends conditions

APPLICATION PUBLICITY

SITE NOTICE EXPIRY: 24.10.2003

PRESS NOTICE EXPIRY: 24.10.2003

REPRESENTATIONS

KNARESBOROUGH TOWN COUNCIL - Objects on the following grounds:

- i) The proposed design and materials, particularly render, is considered to be inappropriate in the conservation area.
- ii) The height of the proposed units on the existing car park are considered to be out of scale with surroundings.
- iii) The demolition and loss of (Teardrop) cottage would be detrimental as it makes a positive contribution to the character of the landscape
- iv) The loss of a tourist amenity on Knaresborough Waterside

The Town Council requests additional plans, with cross sections, to enable a comprehensive assessment of the proposed development, in relation to surrounding area and buildings and retains its objections until such information is available.

The Town Council also object to the application for conservation area consent for demolition as there is no acceptable scheme for redevelopment at present.

OTHER REPRESENTATIONS -

Knaresborough Civic Society:

Object to the demolition of the cottage, question the stability of the rock face, consider

buildings on the car park too high, traffic, loss of views of the cliff face.

Harrogate Civic Society:

Object to the demolition of the cottage, loss of views of the cliff, conflict between pedestrians and traffic on Waterside, no benefit to tourism or preservation or enhancement of the conservation area, no overriding benefits to justify further housing.

Knaresborough Action Group:

Have submitted a four page letter of objection, elaborating on the same points raised by the Town Council and the Civic Societies.

Sixteen letters of objection have been received again reflecting the above points.

Six letters of support have been received.

VOLUNTARY NEIGHBOUR NOTIFICATION

The Old manor House
1,3,5,7,9 Waterbag Bank
17 Waterside
49,51,53,55,59,61,Kirkgate

RELEVANT PLANNING POLICY

- PPG1 Planning Policy Guidance 1: General Policy and Principles
- PPG15 Planning Policy Guidance 15: Planning and the Historic Environment
- SPE4 North Yorkshire County Structure Plan Policy E4
- LPHD01 Harrogate District Local Plan Policy HD1: Statutory list of buildings of special architectural or historic interest
- LPHD03 Harrogate District Local Plan Policy HD3: Control of development in Conservation Areas
- LPA01 Harrogate District Local Plan Policy A1: Impact on the Environment and Amenity
- LPH06 Harrogate District Local Plan Policy H6: Housing developments in the main settlements and villages
- LPH13 Harrogate District Local Plan Policy H13: Housing Density, Layout and Design
- LPH17 Harrogate District Local Plan Policy H17: Housing Type
- LPH05 Harrogate District Local Plan Policy H5: Affordable Housing
- LPHX Harrogate District Local Plan Policy HX: Managed Housing Site Release
- LPR04 Harrogate District Local Plan Policy R4: Open Space Requirements for New Residential Development

ASSESSMENT OF MAIN ISSUES

IMPACT ON THE CONSERVATION AREA AND LISTED BUILDINGS - The application site lies within the development limit of Knaresborough and therefore there is no conflict with the principle of development in terms of policy H6. However a number of criteria have to be met including the appropriateness of the scale and massing of the proposal, the form and character of the settlement residential amenity, open space , overall housing strategy and must accord with all other policies, the most pertinent of which in this case are policies HD3 and HD1. As the principle of development per se is acceptable the assessment should focus on those policies as addressed at the public inquiry last year.

The applicants agents have carried out there own assessment against the Inspectors conclusions and have reached a conclusion that the current submission is acceptable. Although this scheme goes some way to overcoming the concerns and conclusions from the public inquiry it is considered that there are still some fundamental difficulties with the scheme.

Locally there is still concern about the loss of the existing cottage, but the Inspector concluded that the unsympathetic alterations and additions means in its existing state the cottage has a negative impact on the conservation area. On this basis an assessment of whether demolition should be countenanced rests on the quality of the replacement. Unit 1 is an improvement on previous proposals but unit 2 now is three storey in closer proximity to the viaduct and will impact on the views of the viaduct from Waterside when viewed from the north west.

The development of the car park site in the manner proposed will impact on the longer distance views from the castle and the opposite bank of the river. Although attempts have been made to break down the massing of these elements they remain three storeys high. It is considered that this development would not preserve or enhance the conservation area and would have an impact on the setting of nearby listed buildings. There is therefore conflict with policy HD3 and HD1

CONCLUSION - There are no overriding benefits to outweigh the conclusions reached above and refusal of both applications is recommended, since there is no justification to demolish the existing buildings in the absence of a scheme for redevelopment.

CASE OFFICER: Mr R N Watson

RECOMMENDATION

That the application be REFUSED. Reason(s) for refusal:-

- 1 The proposed development by virtue of its scale design, form and massing would be intrusive and overbearing alien to the surrounding form of development in Waterside and would detract from rather than preserve or enhance the conservation area and would adversely affect the setting of the listed viaduct and would therefore conflict with policy HD3 and HD1 of the Harrogate District Local Plan.

